

## Gottschalk on I Timothy 2:4

Gottschalk (c.808–c.867) in Victor Genke and Francis X. Gumerlock (eds. & trans.), *Gottschalk and a Medieval Predestination Controversy: Texts Translated From the Latin* (Milwaukee, WI: Marquette University Press, 2010):

[1] “All those whom God wills to be saved (1 Tm 2:4) are without doubt saved, nor can any be saved but those God wills to be saved. Nor is there any one whom God wills to be saved, and is not saved, since our God has done all things whatever he willed (Ps 134:6). They therefore are all saved—all whom he wills to be saved” (p. 66).

[2] “All’ and ‘every’ have to be understood, that is, as all who are saved, about whom the Apostle says: Who wills all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), and all who are not saved, whom God does not will to be saved” (p. 67).

[3] “It is said of all the members of Christ: All the ends of the world will remember and turn to the Lord. And all the families of the nations will worship in his sight, for the kingdom is the Lord’s, and he will rule over the nations (Ps 21:28-29). And all kings of the earth will worship him; all the nations will serve him (Ps 71:11), and: All the nations that you have made will come and worship before you, Lord, and will glorify your name (Ps 85:9), and: Therefore all died, and he died for all (2 Cor 5:14-15), and: He handed him over for us all (Rom. 8:32), and: Who will all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4) ...” (pp. 120-121).

[4] “God saves by this salvation those upon whom he has mercy in his great goodness, not those whom he hardens with no iniquity. He nonetheless does both by his equally pious and just will and by his most omnipotent power. For the Apostle does not say: He has mercy on whom he wills and hardens whom he does not will, but: He has mercy on whom he wills, and hardens whom he wills (Rom 9:18). Hence, those who want the words of the Apostle: God wills all men to be saved [I Tim. 2:4], to be understood in general both for the elect and for the reprobate, but he saves the elect because they themselves will to be saved, and on the contrary he does not save the reprobate because they do not will to be, can most easily be refuted by the one syllable by which is said: He hardens whom he wills (Rom 9:18). For God truly by no means willed to save with eternal salvation those whom he on that account, as scripture testifies, justly hardens because he wills, not because he does not will. Here let them wake up, if they can, who thus far have not been afraid to believe this and also are not afraid even now. And if they do not blush for shame at what the Lord God said to Moses: I will have mercy on whom I will have mercy, and I will have compassion on whom I will have compassion, and I will be gracious to whom I will be pleased (Ex 33:19)—he did not say: ‘To him who pleases me’—or at what the psalmist said: Great are works of the Lord, sought out in all his wills (Ps 110:2), and: The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps (Ps 134:6) ...” (pp. 144-145).

[5] “God does not will that all men be saved, but only those who are saved. And in the words of the Apostle: Who wills all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), ‘all’ means only all those who are saved” (p. 173).

[6] “[Gottschalk] says, as the old predestinarians also said, that ‘God does not will all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), but only those who are saved; however, all those are saved whom he willed to save and for this reason whoever is not saved absolutely do not belong to that will that they be saved. Since if all those whom God wills to be saved are not saved, he has not done whatever he willed, and if he wills what he cannot do, he is not omnipotent, but weak. But he is omnipotent who has done whatever he willed, as the scripture says: The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps (Ps 134:6) ...” (pp. 176-177).

[7] “[Gottschalk] says that God does not will all men to be saved (1 Tm 2:4), but only those who are saved, but that all are saved whom he willed to save, and for this reason that all those who are not saved did not pertain to that will that they be saved. Scripture says: The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps (Ps 134:6); In your will, Lord, all things have been placed, and there is no one who is able to resist your will (Est 13:9). Therefore, he does not will all to be saved, but only those who are saved, because if he wills what he cannot do, he is not omnipotent” (p. 179).

## **The Views of Gottschalk, as Set Forth (Accurately) by Rabanus Maurus (an Enemy)**

He says, as the old predestinarians also said, that as God predestined some to eternal life, so he also predestined some to eternal death.

He says, as the old predestinarians also said, that “God does not *will all men to be saved* (I Tm 2:4), but only those who are saved; however, all those are saved whom he willed to save and for this reason whoever is not saved absolutely do not belong to that will that they be saved. Since if all those whom God wills to be saved are not saved, he has not done whatever he willed, and if he wills what he cannot do, he is not omnipotent, but weak. But he is omnipotent who has done whatever he willed, as the scripture says: *The Lord has done whatever he willed in heaven and on earth, in the sea and in all the deeps* (Ps. 134:6) ...”

He says, as the old predestinarians also said, that our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ was crucified and died not for the redemption of the whole world, that is, not for the salvation and redemption of all men, but only for those who are saved ...

“But that which is proper and specific only to all of the elect, which their loving crucified redeemer imparted only to them, redeemed, rescued, and cleansed those born and going to be born, the living and the dead, that is, all the elect from both past and present sins. These of course, these are the world for which the Lord suffered, as he himself says: *The bread that I will give is my flesh for the life of the world* (Jn 6:52).”

And in another place that same Gottschalk also writes: “God forbid that I should ever want even to dream or only to whisper that the ancient serpent might be able to carry off with him into eternal perdition any of those for whose redemption such precious blood of our Lord his Son has been poured out to God the Father. Amen.”

Likewise, speaking to God, he says: “And so it is seen quite clearly that no one who has been redeemed by the blood of your cross ever perishes for you.”

*(Letter to Pope Nicholas; pp. 176-177)*